# CITY OF LONG BEACH CITIZEN POLICE COMPLAINT COMMISSION AGENDA

Suely Saro, Chair
Desmond Fletcher, Vice Chair
Leonard Adams Jr., Commissioner
Dana Buchanan, Commissioner
Christian Cooper, Commissioner



# THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 8, 2018 333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:30 PM

Veronica Garcia, Commissioner Richard Lindemann, Commissioner Dianne McNinch, Commissioner Maria Norvell, Commissioner Joni Ricks-Oddie, Commissioner

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director

#### **CALL TO ORDER**

#### **ROLL CALL**

## **CONSENT CALENDAR**

1. 18-075CP Recommendation to receive, file and close the following cases due to lack of evidence and/or witness cooperation or staff recommendation:

CPCC NO.	ALLEGATION(S)
17-179	Failure to Take Action
17-184	<b>Unbecoming Conduct</b>
17-185	<b>Unbecoming Conduct</b>
17-191	Improper Arrest
17-199	Dishonesty

**Suggested Action:** Approve recommendation.

## **REGULAR AGENDA**

2. 18-076CP Recommendation to approve the minutes of the Citizen Police Complaint Commission Regular Meeting of Thursday, October 11, 2018.

**Suggested Action:** Approve recommendation.

3. 18-077CP Recommendation to receive and file City Manager's Report.

**Suggested Action:** Approve recommendation.

4. 18-078CP Recommendation to receive and file a report on No Further Action

Findings.

**Suggested Action:** Approve recommendation.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT: OBTAIN SPEAKER CARD FROM THE CITY CLERK

Opportunity to address the Commission (on non-agenda items) is given to the first 10 persons who submit Speaker Cards to the City Clerk prior to 5:30 p.m. Each speaker is allowed three (3) minutes to make their comments unless that time is extended by the Chair.

### **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

## REMARKS FROM THE CHAIR AND COMMISSIONERS

#### RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION

Recess to Closed Session in the Council Lounge, pursuant to Section 54957 of the California Government Code, for the purpose of consideration of personnel discipline matters.

#### RECONVENE FROM CLOSED SESSION

5. 18-080CP Recommendation to receive Commission's vote and refer findings to the City Manager.

**Suggested Action:** Approve recommendation.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Opportunity is given to those members of the public who have not addressed the Commission on non-agenda items. Each speaker is limited to three (3) minutes unless extended by the Chair.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

I, Jonathan Nagayama, City Clerk Specialist, certify that the agenda was posted not less than 72 hours prior to the meeting.

# CITY OF LONG BEACH CITIZEN POLICE COMPLAINT COMMISSION AGENDA

THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 8, 2018 333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:30 PM

NOTE: The Citizen Police Complaint Commission agenda, supporting documents and a video recording of the meeting are available on the Internet at longbeach.legistar.com. Agenda items may also be reviewed in the Office of the City Clerk. Persons interested in obtaining an agenda via-email should subscribe to the City of Long Beach LinkLB System at www.longbeach.gov/linklb.

jn

THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 8, 2018 333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:30 PM

## NOTE:

If oral language interpretation for non-English speaking persons is desired or if a special accommodation is desired pursuant to the Americans with Disabilities Act, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 24 business hours prior to the Charter Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang interpretasyon ng sinasalitang wika para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles o kung nais ang isang natatanging tulong ayon sa Americans with Disabilities Act, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 24 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Charter Commission.

Si desea interpretación oral en otro idioma para personas que no hablan inglés o si desea una adaptación especial en conformidad con la Ley de Estadounidenses con Discapacidades, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 24 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión de estatutos.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែភាសាផ្ទាល់មាត់ឲ្យអ្នកមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស ឬបើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានដំណោះស្រាយពិសេសដោយយោងតាមមាត្រាច្បាប់ស្ដីពី ជនពិការអាមេរិកាំង សូមមេត្ដាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅទៅការិយាល័យស្ថៀន ក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (24 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្ដើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំ គណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។ If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបវារ: និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ អ្នកឌែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើរអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ ការិយាល័យស្ពៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

# CITY OF LONG BEACH CITIZEN POLICE COMPLAINT COMMISSION MINUTES

Suely Saro, Chair Desmond Fletcher, Vice Chair Leonard Adams Jr., Commissioner Dana Buchanan, Commissioner Christian Cooper, Commissioner



# THURSDAY, OCTOBER 11, 2018 333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:30 PM

Veronica Garcia, Commissioner Richard Lindemann, Commissioner Dianne McNinch, Commissioner Maria Norvell, Commissioner Joni Ricks-Oddie, Commissioner

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director

#### FINISHED AGENDA & DRAFT MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER (5:30 PM)

At 5:30 PM, Chair Saro called the meeting to order.

ROLL CALL (5:30 PM)

Commissioners Leonard Adams Jr., Dana Buchanan, Christian Cooper, Veronica Present: Garcia, Richard Lindemann, Dianne McNinch, Maria Norvell, Joni Ricks-Oddie, Desmond Fletcher and Suely Saro

Also present: Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director; Patrick Weithers, Special Investigator; Darren Lance, Lieutenant, Long Beach Police Department; Monica Kilaita, Deputy City Attorney; Jonathan Nagayama, City Clerk Specialist.

**CONSENT CALENDAR (5:31 PM)** 

Passed the Consent Calendar

A motion was made by Commissioner Cooper, seconded by Commissioner Buchanan, to approve Consent Calendar Item. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 7 - Leonard Adams Jr., Dana Buchanan, Christian Cooper, Veronica Garcia, Dianne McNinch, Maria Norvell and Suely Saro

Abstain: 1 - Richard Lindemann

Absent: 2 - Joni Ricks-Oddie and Desmond Fletcher

**1.** 18-068CP Recommendation to receive, file and close the following cases due to lack of evidence and/or witness cooperation or staff recommendation:

CPCC NO.	<u>ALLEGATION(S)</u>
17-210	Bias Based Policing
17-166	Unbecoming Conduct
17-189	Unbecoming Conduct
18-098	Unbecoming Conduct & Failure to Report
18-106	Unbecoming Conduct

A motion was made to approve recommendation on the Consent Calendar.

# **REGULAR AGENDA (5:32 PM)**

2. 18-069CP Recommendation to approve the minutes of the Citizen Police Complaint Commission Regular Meeting of Thursday, September 13, 2018.

A motion was made by Commissioner McNinch, seconded by Commissioner Garcia, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 7 - Leonard Adams Jr., Dana Buchanan, Christian Cooper, Veronica Garcia, Dianne McNinch, Maria Norvell and Suely Saro

Abstain: 1 - Richard Lindemann

Absent: 2 - Joni Ricks-Oddie and Desmond Fletcher

**3.** 18-070CP Recommendation to receive and file City Manager's Report.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, spoke; and introduced Patrick Weithers, Special Investigator.

Patrick Weithers, Special Investigator, presented the staff report.

A motion was made by Commissioner McNinch, seconded by Commissioner Norvell, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Yes:** 8 - Leonard Adams Jr., Dana Buchanan, Christian Cooper, Veronica Garcia, Richard Lindemann, Dianne McNinch, Maria Norvell and Suely Saro

Absent: 2 - Joni Ricks-Oddie and Desmond Fletcher

**4.** 18-071CP Recommendation to receive and file an update on Commission's Recommendations.

Vice Chair Fletcher joined the meeting.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, presented the staff report.

Chair Saro spoke.

Commissioner Cooper spoke.

Commissioner Ricks-Oddie joined the meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner McNinch, seconded by Commissioner Garcia, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 10 - Leonard Adams Jr., Dana Buchanan, Christian Cooper, Veronica Garcia, Richard Lindemann, Dianne McNinch, Maria Norvell, Joni Ricks-Oddie, Desmond Fletcher and Suely Saro

**5.** 18-072CP Recommendation to receive and file a presentation on the Ralph M. Brown Act.

Monica Kilaita, Deputy City Attorney, provided a PowerPoint presentation.

A motion was made by Commissioner McNinch, seconded by Vice Chair Fletcher, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 10 - Leonard Adams Jr., Dana Buchanan, Christian Cooper, Veronica Garcia, Richard Lindemann, Dianne McNinch, Maria Norvell, Joni Ricks-Oddie, Desmond Fletcher and Suely Saro

# **PUBLIC COMMENT (5:47 PM)**

Brian Mastroluca spoke.

Tracy D. Alcantar spoke.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, spoke.

Stephen Downing spoke.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, spoke.

Stephen Downing spoke.

Chair Saro spoke.

## **EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT (6:02 PM)**

There was no report from the Executive Director.

## REMARKS FROM THE CHAIR AND COMMISSIONERS (6:02 PM)

Chair Saro spoke.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, spoke.

Darren Lance, Lieutenant, Long Beach Police Department, spoke.

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director, spoke.

# RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION (6:05 PM)

At 6:05 PM, there being no objection, Chair Saro recessed the meeting to Closed Session.

# **RECONVENE FROM CLOSED SESSION (9:15 PM)**

At 9:15 PM, Chair Saro reconvened the meeting.

ROLL CALL (9:15 PM)

Commissioners Leonard Adams Jr., Dana Buchanan, Christian Cooper, Veronica Present: Garcia, Richard Lindemann, Dianne McNinch, Maria Norvell, Joni Ricks-Oddie, Desmond Fletcher and Suely Saro

**6.** 18-073CP Recommendation to receive Commission's vote and refer findings to the City Manager.

Chair Saro reported out from Closed Session the following actions taken:

- [1] Case No. 17-200 Commissioners voted 8-2 on Allegation No. 1 Use of Force and 10-0 on Allegations No. 2 Use of Force and 3 Unbecoming Conduct for First and Second Officers accused;
- [2] Case No. 17-201 Commissioners voted 10-0 on Allegation No. 1 Failure to Care for Property for Officer accused;
- [3] Case No. 17-173 Commissioners voted 8-0-2 on Allegation No. 1 Bias Based Policing, 9-1 on Allegation No. 2 Use of Force and 10-0 on Allegation No. 3 Unbecoming Conduct for First and Second Officers accused;
- [4] Case No. 17-178 Commissioners voted 10-0 on Allegation No. 1 Misuse of Authority for Officer accused;
- [5] Case No. 17-172 Commissioners voted 10-0 on Allegation Nos. 1 Dishonesty for First and Second Officers accused and 2 Intimidation for Officer Accused; and
- [6] Case No. 17-182 Commissioners voted 10-0 on Allegation No. 1 Unbecoming Conduct for Officer accused.

A motion was made by Commissioner Adams Jr., seconded by Commissioner Cooper, to approve recommendation. The motion carried by the following vote:

Yes: 10 - Leonard Adams Jr., Dana Buchanan, Christian Cooper, Veronica Garcia, Richard Lindemann, Dianne McNinch, Maria Norvell, Joni Ricks-Oddie, Desmond Fletcher and Suely Saro

# **PUBLIC COMMENT (9:18 PM)**

No members of the public addressed the commission.

# **ADJOURNMENT (9:18 PM)**

At 9:18 PM, there being no objection, Chair Saro declared the meeting adjourned.

jn

THURSDAY, OCTOBER 11, 2018 333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD COUNCIL CHAMBER, 5:30 PM

## NOTE:

If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 72 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ អ្នកដែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើរអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ ការិយាល័យស្ពៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។

# CITY OF LONG BEACH CITIZEN POLICE COMPLAINT COMMISSION AGENDA

Suely Saro, Chair Desmond Fletcher, Vice Chair Leonard Adams Jr., Commissioner Dana Buchanan, Commissioner Christian Cooper, Commissioner



# THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 8, 2018 333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD COUNCIL CHAMBER/LOUNGE, 5:30 PM

Veronica Garcia, Commissioner Richard Lindemann, Commissioner Dianne McNinch, Commissioner Maria Norvell, Commissioner Joni Ricks-Oddie, Commissioner

Anitra Dempsey, Executive Director

## **CLOSED SESSION**

Closed Session pursuant to Section 54957 of the California Government Code for the purpose of consideration of personnel discipline matters.

1.	18-079CP	CPCC NO.	ALLEGATION(S)
		17-189	Unbecoming Conduct
		17-188	Unbecoming Conduct
		17-203	Sexual Misconduct & Bias Based Policing
		17-174	Bias Based Policing
		17-180	Bias Based Policing, Use of Force &
			Dishonesty
		17-181 &	Failure to Investigate & Failure to Take
		18-149	Action
		17-204	Use of Force & Improper Arrest

I, Jonathan Nagayama, City Clerk Specialist, certify that the agenda was posted not less than 72 hours prior to the meeting.

jn

THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 8, 2018 333 W. OCEAN BOULEVARD COUNCIL CHAMBER/LOUNGE, 5:30 PM

# NOTE:

If oral language interpretation for non-English speaking persons is desired or if a special accommodation is desired pursuant to the Americans with Disabilities Act, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 24 business hours prior to the Charter Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang interpretasyon ng sinasalitang wika para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles o kung nais ang isang natatanging tulong ayon sa Americans with Disabilities Act, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 24 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Charter Commission.

Si desea interpretación oral en otro idioma para personas que no hablan inglés o si desea una adaptación especial en conformidad con la Ley de Estadounidenses con Discapacidades, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la Secretaría Municipal al (562) 570-6101, 24 horas hábiles antes de la reunión de la comisión de estatutos.

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែភាសាផ្ទាល់មាត់ឲ្យអ្នកមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស ឬបើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានដំណោះស្រាយពិសេសដោយយោងតាមមាត្រាច្បាប់ស្ដីពី ជនពិការអាមេរិកាំង សូមមេត្ដាធ្វើសំណើអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅទៅការិយាល័យស្ថៀន ក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (24 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹងចាប់ផ្ដើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំ គណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។ If written language translation of the Commission agenda and minutes for non-English speaking persons is desired, please make your request by phone to the Office of the City Clerk at (562) 570-6101, 72 business hours prior to the Commission meeting.

Kung nais ang pagsasalin ng nakasulat na wika ng agenda ng Komisyon at ang minutes para sa mga taong hindi nagsasalita ng Ingles, mangyaring isagawa ang iyong hiling sa pamamagitan ng telepono sa Opisina ng Clerk ng Lungsod sa (562) 570-6101, 72 oras ng negosyo bago ang pagpupulong ng Commission.

Si desea obtener la traducción escrita en otro idioma de la agenda y actas de la comisión para personas que no hablan inglés, haga su solicitud por teléfono a la Oficina de la

បើមានការចង់បានឲ្យមានការបកប្រែឯកសារស្តីពីរបៀបវារៈ និងកំណត់ហេតុឲ្យ អ្នកនែលមិនចេះនិយាយអង់គ្លេស សូមមេត្តាធ្វើសំណើរអ្នកតាមទូរស័ព្ទដោយហៅ ការិយាល័យស្ពៀនក្រុងតាមរយៈលេខ (562) 570-6101 (72 ម៉ោងធ្វើការមុននឹង ចាប់ផ្តើមបើកកិច្ចប្រជុំគណកម្មការធម្មនុញ្ញ)។